



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

THE DEVELOPMENT OF CHRISTIAN SYMBOLISM AS ILLUSTRATED IN ROMAN CATACOMB PAINTING

SINCE the publication of Wilpert's *corpus* of Roman Catacomb paintings in 1903, comparative study of Early Christian art has been greatly facilitated.¹ It is now possible to consider the entire series of catacomb paintings as a whole, just as well as to pursue investigations of separate frescoes or of particular themes. To be sure, study based only on the *corpus* can take but little account of the relative size and arrangement of the respective pictures, their locations in the catacombs, and their immediate surroundings, all of which are important for the drawing of accurate conclusions, so personal examination of the originals is as necessary now as it ever was. The *corpus*, however, is exceedingly valuable, not only because of its absolutely faithful reproduction of the frescoes in respect to technique, but because it is intended to be a trustworthy preservation of originals which time will one day destroy.²

The grouping together of these several hundred plates of paintings has emphasized, for one thing, the essentially symbolic nature of Christian art of the first four centuries. It was scarcely before the fourth century that the didactic themes were introduced, and then naturally enough in response to the demand occasioned by the baptism of the unlearned and only semi-converted populace of the Roman Empire. Accordingly we see in the church mosaics not only the symbolic themes which would appeal to the understanding of the Christian

¹ *Die Malereien der Katakomben Roms*, Freiburg, i. B., 2 Vols. The same in Italian, *Le Pitture delle Catacombe Romane*, Rome.

² This can be observed even in the few years since the publication of Mgr. Wilpert's work. Yet most persons, in comparing the reproductions with the originals, fail to note that the frescoes were washed and cleansed before being photographed and copied, and that this work was done under the best possible conditions of light and atmosphere.

versed in the Scriptures, but also purely didactic themes teaching ignorant men the essential facts of Christianity. And also there was devised in this period of mosaics a series of symbolic themes addressed to unconverted men, but of such character that their persuasive and salutary intention could not be mistaken.¹ This, of course, was altogether different from the symbolism of the pre-Constantinian period, which was intended to be a comfort and a stimulus to men who were certainly Christians.

The art of the catacombs was symbolic in every sense of the word. Not only did the themes themselves present symbolic truth, but even the treatment of the various themes was symbolic. Realism was of little importance in the subterranean paintings, and to such an extent is this true that they may well be characterized as impressionistic. Noah standing in a craft in shape and size very similar to a box is perfectly adequate to symbolize the story of the patriarch and his family and the animals in the ark sailing safely over the waters of the flood. And the theme thus constituted symbolically, and not realistically, symbolized in turn to the discerning Christian great doctrinal truths, such as baptism,² regeneration, divine deliverance, and even the resurrection. This symbolic mode of presenting symbolic truth is justly counted by Mr. Lowrie as being to the distinct advantage of the entire series of catacomb frescoes.³

The catacomb period as such continued over the first four centuries. During this time the symbolic thought of the Church underwent a certain development, as one would naturally expect. It is to be understood, of course, that the symbolic thought here referred to is that expressed by the people of the Church as distinguished from the formal symbols to be found in the abundant theological literature of the period. It is scarcely comprehended even yet what a rich mass of information the catacombs have given us concerning the belief and hope of the

¹ A positive illustration that the point of Christian doctrine was understood and appreciated by fourth century pagans is afforded in the frescoes of the judgment of Vibia in Pluto's court to be found in the catacomb of the Syncretists on the Via Appia. It is a manifest copy of the Christian theme of the judgment of the deceased before Christ's throne.

² 1 Peter, iii, 20, 21. Tertullian, *De Baptismo*, 8.

³ Lowrie, *Monuments of the Early Church (Christian Art and Archaeology)*, pp. 196, 197.

common man, the average Christian, for which one may search in vain the apologetic, explanatory, or anti-heretical writings of the Fathers. The development of this symbolic thought is illustrated by the treatment accorded the various themes portrayed. It may therefore be traced by the simple expedient of observing the introduction and relative popularity of the respective themes, as well as their decline and rejection. A moderately accurate estimate of the prevailing sentiment of each century, and even of each generation, may be attained by such observation. All that is attempted here is a rather general statement of the development of symbolic thought as measured by centuries.

In the following tables the list of themes is given with the number of times that each theme is treated in the frescoes of the Roman catacombs during the several centuries. The series is thus presented in chronological order, so that it will be a simple matter to glance at the tables to determine what themes were introduced in each century, how long they were continued, and how popular they were during the centuries. The tables, therefore, will give an indication of the esteem in which any theme was held by contemporaries. This estimate will, as a rule, be trustworthy, because sufficient paintings have been discovered and preserved to permit us to formulate generalizations. However, it must always be remembered not only that countless paintings were ruthlessly destroyed in the barbarian and Saracen invasions, but also many more have been stolen and ruined by modern vandals, some of which had been noted by explorers in the time of the Renaissance.¹ Besides this, large-areas yet remain to be excavated, and nobody can tell what may be found in them. If *all* the paintings were at hand for examination, doubtless the ratios existing at present between the popularity of such and such themes would have to be altered, but probably not very much. Enough are at hand and are distributed sufficiently to establish the belief that they are representative both in chronological order and in ratio.

The statistics contained in these tables are based on Wilpert's *corpus*. The plates in his *corpus* are arranged more or less in chronological order, but not all the paintings are repro-

¹ Paintings once noted but now destroyed are included in the tables with the + sign in front of the number for each century. Most are of the fourth.

duced. Practically all discovered to the date of publication are enumerated in the text, however, and also with the frescoes of each theme in chronological succession.¹ These tables simply present them in convenient form for comparative study and are made from the text and plates.

Wilpert's chronology is followed throughout. It is accepted universally, even by those who do not agree with his interpretation of themes.² A defence of this chronology may not be attempted here, save to point out that it is founded on scientific criteria, such as the quality and number of layers of stucco, the technical execution of the paintings, all the details of the compositions, including the styles of clothing and hairdressing, the laws of symmetry and grouping, the position of the painting in the catacomb, with all that may be gathered from such position, particularly the valuable epigraphic evidence, as well as information to be found in the itineraries, guide books, and other writings of early mediaeval pilgrims relative thereto.

Of these 132 subjects or themes it will be observed that 20 are first century in origin, 34 are second, 22 are third, 49 are fourth, and 7 are fifth century and later.³ Considering the nature of the themes of the several centuries we cannot help remarking a considerable difference. Thus, in the first century they seem to be subjects taken from nature, such as were common in contemporary pagan art, and used largely for decorative purposes. The list includes dolphins, vine and flower designs, cupids, peacocks and other birds, animal forms, a sea monster, ideal forms, landscape *genre* pictures, a fishing scene, and various decorative designs.⁴ Regarding these first century pictures it must be remembered that they are found exclusively

¹ The *corpus* also (in Supplements I and II) arranges the paintings of each catacomb, and gives a chronological order of all the frescoes.

² Cf., e.g., Von Sybel, in his chapter on catacomb painting in Vol. I of his *Christliche Antike*.

³ It must not be supposed that because the sum total of the representations of the themes enumerated is 1465 that number of paintings exists in the catacombs. In the enumeration above the various pictures have been dissected into their component parts, and the themes that are particularly important for symbolic or historical reasons have been thus isolated, so that the list contains a number of duplications, and is not entirely consistent in scheme.

⁴ Second half of the first century, catacomb of Domitilla. Wilpert, *Malereien*, pl. 1 ff.

in the catacomb of Domitilla in the hypogeum of the Flavian family, and in a room known as the "oldest cubiculum," and in the catacomb of Priscilla in the hypogeum of the well known Acilian family. So they are not widely distributed, and exist in only one or two examples each. All that they can be said to do is to indicate the link connecting Christian art with pagan art historically, and to mark the beginnings of the Christian. They give an idea of what Christian art would have been like if it had existed in any great measure.

There are, however, several pictures from Biblical sources in this collection, Daniel between the Lions, Noah, and the Good Shepherd. Cupid is also represented as the Good Shepherd, in the type of the Pasturing Shepherd. The Christian Good Shepherd was the King of Love, and the earliest artists, in their embarrassment at originating symbols of divine import, did not hesitate to make use of appropriate attributes, wherever they found them. The pagan Cupid as shepherd served their purpose very well, although it is reasonable to look for the origin of the Good Shepherd of the catacombs in the Scriptures.

The three Biblical themes originated in the first century are adequate only to announce the character of Christian art of the next three centuries. They declare that it will be symbolic. The reason for this prevailing symbolic quality is not hard to determine. The early Christian thought a great deal about the deep truths of his religion. His meditation was guided largely by the sacred writings which he possessed. If he wished to decorate at all the sepulchre of his dear ones with fresco paintings it would be only natural that he should base such decoration on the Scriptures, and being decoration it would have to portray some scene or action. That is, a decoration could hardly express the theological doctrines of St. Paul arranged in logical order as contained in his Epistles. A picture was necessary, and a picture rich in meaning with a point appropriate to its use. The cycle of catacomb themes is limited at once from the very fact they were selected as being appropriate for catacombs. It is thus seen that the reason why early Christian art is symbolic is not because of any intention of concealing mysteries, but because of the necessity of basing it on a distinctive kind of pictures, as well

as because of the pleasure the symbolism gave to the discerning individual Christian when he contemplated the pictures.

The connection with pagan art and pagan custom is further illustrated by a painting of the funeral banquet which formed such an integral part of the ceremonies of interment. While there are only four treatments of this theme in the catacombs, the custom was generally observed by Christians, just as by pagans, and with no offence to their religious scruples. The funeral feast was regarded as being a regular part of the burial duty toward the deceased, as much so as providing them with sarcophagi, or bearing them to their *loculi* in the catacombs. Self respect demanded that these feasts be observed, as well as those maintained on the anniversaries of death or deposition.

In the second century, and early in the century, the frame and groundwork of Christian catacomb symbolism was evolved, and its character fully determined. Here we find expressed in symbolic guise the great doctrines of the scheme of salvation that comfort and reassure the Christian in the thought of death and brighten his hope beyond the grave. In viewing these paintings he would call to mind the divine nature of Christ as attested by His birth from the Virgin and by His miraculous acts, and the witness of the Old and New Testaments to the same. Then he might contemplate Christ's soteriological work, especially as applied to the deceased. He would observe frescoes that both represent and symbolize the sacraments, affording grace for eternal life. Particularly would he find the fundamental elements of Christian eschatology emphasized — after death the judgment, and in the end the resurrection, also heavenly felicity for those whom Christ saved. Continually would he contemplate God's grace and the spiritual nature of the Christian life, especially in its relation to the Kingdom of God.

This may be indicated briefly in outline :

Christological Themes	{	I. <i>The Incarnation</i>
		Isaiah's Prophecy (Is. vii. 14)
		Adoration of the Wise Men
		Annunciation
		II. <i>Divine Nature of Christ</i>
		Miracle of the Paralytic
		Miracle of the Woman with an Issue of Blood
		(Raising of Lazarus)

Soteriological Themes	{ <ul style="list-style-type: none"> I. <i>Christ as Agent</i> The Sacrifice of Isaac "Behold the Lamb of God" II. <i>The Grace of Christ as Saviour</i> The Good Shepherd Orpheus (Susannah)
Eschatological Themes	{ <ul style="list-style-type: none"> I. <i>Salvation from Sin and Death</i> Daniel among the Lions Noah The Babylonian Children Susannah (Christ's Miracles) Ship in Storm II. <i>The Last Judgment</i> Christ as Judge III. <i>The Resurrection</i> The Seasons The Raising of Lazarus Jonah (?) IV. <i>Heavenly Felicity</i> Introduction into Paradise Sheep in Green Pastures Deceased as Saints The Orant¹ The Woman of Samaria (the Living Water which affords Eternal Life).
Sacramental Themes	{ <ul style="list-style-type: none"> I. <i>Baptism</i> The Rite of Baptism Moses striking the Rock Fisherman Paralytic healed at Pool of Bethesda Noah II. <i>The Eucharist</i> Breaking of Bread Eucharistic Feast Multiplication of Loaves The "Break-fast" by the Sea of Galilee after the Resurrection Eucharistic Tripods, Baskets of Loaves, Fish, Wine Vessels, etc.

The third century mainly repeats what had been originated in the second, and the great majority of the themes are con-

¹ The Orant has never been interpreted satisfactorily.

tinued in increasing ratio in the fourth. Very little that was new was added in the third century, and the new element consists chiefly in more varied patterns for purely decorative purposes. Among the symbolic themes God's omnipotence and grace are further enlarged, and there seems to be a particular realization of the doctrine of sin, *i.e.* original sin. Adam and Eve are treated four times.

In this century the artists overcome their reluctance to paint Christ realistically, and depict Him as giving His New Law to men. The apostles, including St. Peter, are also painted, but it is manifest that the portrait characteristics depend at the most only on tradition. These pictures belong to the latter half of the century, and proclaim the beginning of the Apocalyptic cycle which received extensive development in the fourth century and later.

Several miracle themes are added in the third century, as those of the Blind Man and the Leper. God's providence in salvation is further indicated by the themes of Tobias, Job, and David. Eucharistic symbolism is increased by the theme of the miracle of the Wine at the marriage feast at Cana of Galilee. It was used in connection with the miracle of the Multiplication of Loaves to symbolize the eucharistic elements, the Fish having by this time developed from its eucharistic symbolism to that represented in the acrostic, as Professor Morey has pointed out.

The Woman of Samaria ceases in this century. Several odd themes appear, such as isolated scenes from real life, including the activities of the fossors, and one that seems to represent the act of veiling a consecrated virgin.¹ One of the so-called *refrigerium* pictures occurs in this century, further pointing to the apocalyptic characteristic of the fourth.

In the fourth century the themes mentioned above are repeated in greater ratio, but with more or less crudity of expression. Yet the fourth century marks a turning point in Christian symbolism. The real change came as a result of Constantine's edict and reflects the changes that took place in the composition of the Church after the peace. An immense

¹ Cf. Tertullian's ideas on this subject as contained in his tract, *De Virginibus Velandis*.

number of persons were admitted who both originated and developed the cult of the Saints and Martyrs and Apostles, and found artistic background for this in the Apocalypse.

The cult arose, doubtless, in a natural enough way: The individual admitted his sinful condition. He was not only afflicted with the guilt of Adam's sin (Adam and Eve are treated fourteen times in this century), but because of his own transgressions was decidedly unworthy. The glorified Christ had saved him, but in his intercessions why not entreat the good offices of the apostles and martyrs who, because of their sufferings, must be very dear to Christ? The memory of the martyrs was still fresh in Rome, and the apostles Peter and Paul were credited with the founding of the Roman church. In some such way as this, step by step, as the inscriptions also testify, the cult arose, and was accepted readily by those who were perfectly willing to exchange Mithras, Isis, and Ceres for SS. Mary,¹ Peter, Paul, Lawrence, Sebastian, Felicitas and her seven sons, etc.

Artistically, we find that the mysterious glory of the Apocalypse seemed to appeal to those who expressed their cult in fresco, and from the fifth century on we know how magnificently it was worked out in the great church mosaics. Symbolism was thus enriched in some respects, such as in mystery and complexity, but it lost the simple depth of thought contained in the frescoes of the second and third centuries.

The characterization given above of the new element in the symbolism of the fourth century is demanded by the numerous pictures of Christ in the college of the apostles, saints, and martyrs, the *refrigerium*, the Evangelists, angels, the cross and nimbus, and the mountain whence flow the four evangelical streams which were painted in that century. Here also belongs the Agape, in all probability.

These are not the only themes added in this century. The symbolism of the previous centuries is increased by a number of appropriate subjects. There are several more miracles, such as the Healing of the Demoniac, the Rain of Manna, which

¹ There is no trace of Mariolatry as a cult, however, till the fifth century in Rome.

probably belongs to the eucharistic cycle, and the Raising of the Daughter of Jairus. This last theme is certainly a symbol of the resurrection, as is perhaps the fresco of the Translation of Elijah.

An especial emphasis seems to be placed on the doctrine of the person of Christ, conformably to the extensive controversies that agitated the theologians of the period. His human and divine natures in one personality are set forth in an addition to the Madonna cycle of sixteen frescoes, including the Nativity at Bethlehem and the prophecies of Balaam and Micah.¹

A reference to the customary test applied to Christians in the days of persecution is very probably found in a treatment of the three Hebrew children before Nebuchadnezzar's image, the image consisting of a herm of the monarch. God's deliverance is further symbolized by a painting of Moses and Aaron persecuted by the Jews. Moses is also depicted removing his sandals in the presence of God. Peter's humiliation is treated once, as is the parable of the Wise and Foolish Virgins.

In the fourth century there are a number of themes from real life, evidently referring to the occupation of the deceased. Thus, the charioteer who won in the circus has also run his earthly race and will receive the crown from a winged Victory. A soldier's portrait is found, as well as various pagan subjects such as Oceanus. Oceanus may have referred to the sea-faring occupation of the man whose tomb he adorns. There are also scenes from the shop of the miller, the baker, the grain dealer, the herb woman, etc. There are also a few new ideas in geometric decoration.

Paintings from the fifth to the ninth century are found in the Roman catacombs, and continue the apocalyptic characteristic of the fourth in accordance with contemporary ideas and in the full wealth of Byzantine expression. A certain matter-of-fact quality is now to be observed, as in the frescoes at the tomb of the martyr bishop Cornelius, in the catacomb of Callixtus. The pictured saints look as if they had a perfect right to be where they are, and might give valuable assistance to those who entreated them. These pictures conform in all respects to

¹ Num. xxiv. 17; Micah v. 2.

the recognized canons of the Byzantine art of the period, and are like the corresponding mosaics.

In the catacomb of St. Valentine a curious series of seventh century frescoes is observed, consisting of scenes of the nativity and the crucifixion. This is the only picture of the crucifixion in the entire field of catacomb art, and is one of the earliest paintings of the theme yet discovered.

Such is an outline sketch of the development of symbolic thought among the people of the Church during the first four centuries, as illustrated in catacomb painting. Beginning with inoffensive classic types, the Christian artists rapidly created a series of paintings that expressed in symbolic form the salutary principles of their religion and their bright hope of the life to come. This underwent a constant development, both by confirming in numerous repetitions the themes already elected, and by adding new themes of similar and different import to those previously chosen. Then, in the fourth century, an entirely new series was originated in response to the cult of the martyrs. By an examination of the themes as tabulated it is possible thus to trace the development of popular religious thought. It is reflected significantly in the paintings. It is to be observed that while this corresponds in general with what we have always known concerning the history of the early Church, a considerable amount of information is obtained concerning matters of detail. An entire series of symbols is added to the theological ones of the ante-Nicene Fathers. Because of their simplicity they are much more refreshing than the fanciful allegorical wanderings and arid speculations of many of the verbose Fathers. But their chief value consists in the fact that they reflect accurately the thought of the Christian people.

TABLE OF PAINTINGS IN THE CATACOMBS¹

NUMBER	SUBJECTS	I	II	III	IV	LATER	TOTAL
1	Grape Vine Designs . .	1	1	—	4	—	6
2	Cupids	2	1	3	11	—	17
3	Birds (general)	1	9	22	67	1	100
4	Peacocks	1	6	7	8	—	22
5	Decorative Patterns (varied)	5	9	29	71	1	115
6	Dolphins	1	2	3	2	—	8
7	Daniel among Lions . .	1	2	1/2 1 ψ 1 2/2 5 ω 6 13 + 3 23	α 2 1/2 4 ψ 6 2/2 8 20 + 3 23	—	39
8	Fishing Scenes	1	2	—	—	—	3
9	Animal Groups	1	1	10	4	1	17
10	Noah	1	α 1	1/2 2 ψ 2 2/2 3 ω 2 9	α 1 1/2 4 ψ 8 2/2 7 20 + 4 24	—	35
11	Asters	1	—	—	—	—	1
12	Landscape, and <i>Genre</i> Pictures	2	—	2	1	—	5
13	Ideal Heads	1	4	1	4	—	10
14	Funeral Banquet. . . .	1	—	2	1	—	4
15	Cups, Vases, etc. . . .	1	6	8	17	—	32
16	Good Shepherd	3	11	29	53 + 13	1	110
17	Ideal Human Figures . .	1	—	—	7	—	8
18	Cupid as Shepherd . . .	1	—	—	—	—	1
19	Sea Monster	1	2	2	1	—	6
20	Sheep and Milkpail . . .	1	1	5	2	—	9
21	Moses striking Rock . .	—	5	1/2 3 2/2 6 ω 3 12	1/2 15 ψ 13 2/2 18 46 + 5 51	—	68
22	Babylonian Children . .	—	α 1	3	11 + 4	—	19

¹ The abbreviations α, ψ, ω, 1/2 and 2/2 indicate the beginning, middle, end, first half and second half respectively of the century listed in Roman numerals at the head of the column.

NUMBER	SUBJECTS	I	II	III	IV	LATER	TOTAL
23	Baptism	—	$\alpha 1$ $1/2 1$ $2/2 2$ $\overline{4}$	$1/2 1$ $\psi \frac{1}{2}$ $\psi + \frac{1}{3}$	$2/2 2$	1	635
							10
24	The Seasons	—	2	1	5	—	8
25	Susannah	—	1	1	4	—	6
26	Breaking of Bread	—	1	—	—	—	1
27	Sacrifice of Isaac	—	$\alpha 1$ $2/2 1$ $\overline{2}$	$\psi 1$ $2/2 2$ $\omega 2$ $\overline{5}$	$1/2 4$ $\psi 3$ $2/2 5$ $\omega 1$ $\overline{13}$ $+ 1$ $\overline{14}$	—	21
28	Raising of Lazarus	—	$\alpha 1$ $1/2 1$ $2/2 2$ $\omega 2$ $\overline{6}$	$1/2 3$ $\psi 1$ $2/2 2$ $\omega 1$ $\overline{7}$	$\alpha 3$ $1/2 11$ $\psi 8$ $2/2 16$ $\overline{38}$ $+ 3$ $\overline{41}$	—	54
29	Orants	—	5	57	92	3	157
30	Deceased as Saints	—	3	2	13	—	18
31	Behold the Lamb of God . .	—	$1/2 1$	—	—	—	1
32	Woman of Samaria	—	$1/2 1$ $2/2 1$ $\overline{2}$	$1/2 1$ $\psi \frac{1}{2}$	—	—	4
33	Woman with Issue of Blood	—	$1/2 1$	2	2	—	5
34	Prophets and Prophecy. . .	—	$1/2 1$	+ 1	1	—	3
35	Virgin and Child	—	$\alpha 1$ $1/2 1$ $\overline{2}$	$1/2 1$ $2/2 3$ $\overline{4}$ $+ 1$ $\overline{5}$	$1/2 3$ $\psi 2$ $2/2 7$ $\overline{12}$ $+ 4$ $\overline{16}$	2	25
36	Christ as Judge	—	2	4	9	—	15
37	Genius	—	2	—	3	—	5
38	Jonah	—	$1/2 1$ $2/2 3$ $\omega 4$ $\overline{8}$	$1/2 2$ $\psi 4$ $2/2 7$ $\omega 4$ $\overline{17}$	$\alpha 2$ $1/2 12$ $\psi 7$ $2/2 6$ $\overline{27}$ $+ 6$ $\overline{33}$	—	58

NUMBER	SUBJECTS	I	II	III	IV	LATER	TOTAL
							1026
39	Fish — separate	—	3	1	—	—	4
40	Unidentified Themes . . .	—	1	1	4	—	6
41	Orpheus	—	1	2	2	—	5
42	Tripods (eucharistic) . . .	—	2	—	—	—	2
43	Baskets of Bread (isolated)	—	1	1	1	—	3
44	Introduction into Paradise	—	1	4	6	—	
			? $\frac{1}{2}$				12
45	Eucharistic Meal	—	2/2 2	—	1/2 4	—	
			ω $\frac{2}{4}$		ψ $\frac{3}{7}$		11
46	Paralytic Healed	—	α 1	ψ 3	α 1		
			2/2 1	2/2 2	1/2 2		
			ω $\frac{1}{2}$	ψ 2	ψ 2		
				6	2/2 6		
					11		
					+ 1		
					12	—	20
47	Multiplication of Loaves . .	—	2/2 1	1/2 2	1/2 5		
				ψ 2	ψ 6		
				2/2 1	2/2 9		
				ω 4	20		
				9	+ 2		
					22	—	32
48	Crown of Leaves	—	1	3	3	—	7
49	Sheep (not Good Shepherd)	—	2	8	17	1	28
50	Annunciation	—	1	1	—	—	2
51	Roses	—	1	4	6	—	11
52	Fossors	—	1	6	3	—	10
53	Gestures of Prayer, Adoration, etc. (not orant) . .	—	1	1	2	—	4
54	Ship (other than Jonah) . .	—	1	—	1	—	2
55	Christ as Teacher, Giver of New Law.	—	—	1	8	—	9
56	Amor and Psyche	—	—	1	1	—	2
57	David (with sling)	—	—	1	—	—	1
58	Tobias	—	—	1	2	—	3
59	Job	—	—	2	6 + 3	—	11
60	Healing of Blind Man . . .	—	—	5	1 + 1	—	7
61	Healing of Leper	—	—	2	1	—	3
62	Unclassified Miracle Scenes	—	—	1	1	—	2
63	Wine Miracle at Cana . . .	—	—	1/2 1	ψ 1		
				ω $\frac{1}{2}$		—	3
64	Scenes from Real Life . . .	—	—	1	6	—	7

NUMBER	SUBJECTS	I	II	III	IV	LATER	TOTAL
65	Adam and Eve	—	—	$\psi 1$ $2/2 2$ $\omega \frac{1}{4}$	$\alpha 1$ $1/2 5$ $\psi 1$ $2/2 7$ $\frac{14}{14}$	—	1233
66	Veiling of Consecrated Virgin	—	—	1	—	—	18
67	Christ (without particular attributes)	—	—	1	15	2	18
68	Daniel (not with lions)	—	—	1	—	—	1
69	Apostles	—	—	1	4	—	5
70	Martyr with Crown	—	—	1	—	2	3
71	St. Peter	—	—	1	2	—	3
72	Shepherd milking Sheep	—	—	2	—	—	2
73	Cup Bearer	—	—	1	—	—	1
74	Refrigerium	—	—	1	3	—	4
75	Inscriptions of Note	—	—	4	19	8	31
76	Masks	—	—	1	—	—	1
77	Daughter of Jairus	—	—	—	$\alpha 1$	—	1
78	Nebuchadnezzar's Image	—	—	—	$1 + 1$	—	2
79	Nebuchadnezzar	—	—	—	$1 + 1$	—	2
80	Saints in Presence of Christ	—	—	—	1	3	4
81	Saints crowned by Christ	—	—	—	1	2	3
82	Christ in midst of Apostles	—	—	—	14	—	14
83	Oceanus	—	—	—	1	—	1
84	Caduceus	—	—	—	1	—	1
85	Horses	—	—	—	2	—	2
86	Charioteer and Chariot	—	—	—	1	—	1
87	Victories	—	—	—	1	—	1
88	Kanephora	—	—	—	2	—	2
89	Runner	—	—	—	1	—	1
90	Muses	—	—	—	1	—	1
91	Soldier	—	—	—	1	—	1
92	Weapons	—	—	—	1	—	1
93	The Manger (Presepio)	—	—	—	2	—	2
94	Eucharistic Symbols Bread and Wine (isolated)	—	—	—	2	—	2
95	Shepherds of Bethlehem	—	—	—	1	—	1
96	Balaam	—	—	—	3	—	3
97	Helios	—	—	—	1	—	1
98	Tricliniarch	—	—	—	1	—	1
99	Serpent	—	—	—	3	—	3
100	The Evangelists	—	—	—	1	—	1
101	Keys	—	—	—	1	—	1

NUMBER	SUBJECTS	I	II	III	IV	LATER	TOTAL
							1374
102	Agape	—	—	—	4 + 2	—	6
103	Concealed Cross	—	—	—	1	—	1
104	Moses (other than at rock)	—	—	—	6	—	6
105	Wise and Foolish Virgins	—	—	—	2	—	2
106	Triptych	—	—	—	1	—	1
107	The Cross	—	—	—	3	5	8
108	* and Variations	—	—	—	9	—	9
109	SS. Peter and Paul	—	—	—	7	—	7
110	Wolves	—	—	—	2	—	2
111	Opus Alexandrinum	—	—	—	1	—	1
112	Mss. Rolls and Cases for Same	—	—	—	6	—	6
113	Angels	—	—	—	1	1	2
114	Nimbus	—	1 (?)	—	8	10	18
115	Multitude satisfied with Bread	—	—	—	1	—	1
116	Martyrs	—	—	—	2	—	2
117	The Moon	—	—	—	1	—	1
118	Man with Roll	—	—	—	1	—	1
119	Moses and Aaron perse- cuted by the Jews	—	—	—	1	—	1
120	Bethlehem	—	—	—	1	—	1
121	Translation of Elijah	—	—	—	1	—	1
122	Peter's Denial	—	—	—	1	—	1
123	Rain of Manna	—	—	—	1	—	1
124	Healing of Demoniac	—	—	—	2	—	2
125	Mountain with Four Streams	—	—	—	1	—	1
126	Jewelled Cross	—	—	—	—	ω V 1 VI or } 1 VII } IX 1 3	3
127	Books	—	—	—	—	ω V 1	1
128	St. John the Baptist	—	—	—	—	VI or } 1 VII }	1
129	Visitation of Mary	—	—	—	—	VII 1	1
130	Bath of the Christ Child	—	—	—	—	VII 1	1
131	Christ Child in Cradle	—	—	—	—	VII 1	1
132	Crucifixion and Group at the Cross	—	—	—	—	VII 1	1
							1465

CLARK D. LAMBERTON.

UNIVERSITY OF PENNSYLVANIA,
PHILADELPHIA.